



The

PAKISTAN PARADOX

INSTABILITY
AND RESILIENCE

Christophe Jaffrelot



The
**PAKISTAN
PARADOX**
INSTABILITY
AND RESILIENCE
Christophe Jaffrelot

15231

Translated by
Cynthia Schoch



PENGUIN BOOKS

An imprint of Penguin Random House

PENGUIN BOOKS

USA | Canada | UK | Ireland | Australia
New Zealand | India | South Africa | China

Penguin Books is part of the Penguin Random House group of companies
whose addresses can be found at global.penguinrandomhouse.com

Published by Penguin Random House India Pvt. Ltd
7th Floor, Infinity Tower C, DLF Cyber City,
Gurgaon 122 002, Haryana, India



Penguin
Random House
India

First published in French as *Le syndrome pakistanais*, Fayard, Paris 2013
Published in Vintage by Random House India 2015
Published by Penguin Books India 2016

Copyright © Christophe Jaffrelot 2015
English translation copyright © Cynthia Schoch 2015

All rights reserved

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2

The views and opinions expressed in this book are the author's own and the
facts are as reported by him which have been verified to the extent possible,
and the publishers are not in any way liable for the same.

ISBN 9780143426837

For sale in the Indian Subcontinent only
Printed at Repro Knowledgecast Limited, India

This book is sold subject to the condition that it shall not, by way of trade or otherwise,
be lent, resold, hired out, or otherwise circulated without the publisher's prior consent in
any form of binding or cover other than that in which it is published and without a
similar condition including this condition, being imposed on any subsequent purchaser.

CONTENTS

<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>Preface and Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>Introduction</i>	1
<i>Three Wars, Three Constitutions and Three Coups</i>	2
<i>Between India and Afghanistan: Caught in a Pincer Movement?</i>	6
<i>The Pakistani Paradox</i>	8

PART ONE

NATIONALISM WITHOUT A NATION—AND EVEN WITHOUT A PEOPLE?

1. The Socio-Ethnic Origins of Indian Muslim Separatism: The Reform Phase (1857–1906)	25
<i>The Crushing of the 1857 Revolt and Reactions of the Muslim Elite</i>	26
<i>From the Aligarh Movement to the Muslim League</i>	31
<i>Muslimhood as a Communal Ideology</i>	46
2. An Elite in Search of a State—and a Nation (1906–1947)	53
<i>Muslim Politics beyond the North Indian Elite</i>	54
<i>Jinnah, the Congress and the Muslim-majority Provinces</i>	64
<i>Majority Muslims versus Minority Muslims</i>	70
<i>Jinnah's Strategy</i>	76
<i>The 1946 Elections: What Turning Point?</i>	86
3. Islamic State or a Collection of Ethnic Groups? From One Partition to the Next	97
<i>Jinnah's Nation-State: Between "The Poison of Provincialism" and the Indian Threat</i>	98

CONTENTS

<i>Stillborn Federalism and the Unresolved Ethno-linguistic Issue</i>	101
<i>Muhajirs and Punjabis, Founding Fathers of a Unitary and Centralised State</i>	104
<i>Bengali Separatism: Mujibur Rahman, the Two-Economy Theory and the Centre's Overreaction</i>	118
<i>Five Ethnic Groups for One Nation: Between Support and Alienation</i>	127
<i>The Pakistanisation of Sindh</i>	128
<i>The Baloch Self-Determination Movement</i>	135
<i>The Pashtuns, from Pashtunistan to Pakhtunkwa</i>	152
<i>Muhajir Militancy—and Its Limitations</i>	160
<i>National Integration through Federalism and Regionalisation of Politics?</i>	181

PART TWO

NEITHER DEMOCRACY NOR AUTOCRACY?

5. Impossible Democracy or Impossible Democrats?	197
<i>An Initial Democratic Design Aborted (1947–1958)</i>	199
<i>Democratisation, Separatism and Authoritarianism (1969–1977)</i>	216
<i>Civilians under Influence—and Prone to Lawlessness (1988–1999)</i>	239
<i>A Democratic "Transition" without Transfer of Power? (2007–2013)</i>	259
<i>The 2013 Elections: What "New Pakistan"?</i>	278
<i>The 2014 Crisis: Imran Khan, Qadri, Nawaz Sharif and the Army</i>	282
6. Variable-Geometry Military Dictatorship	299
<i>Ayub Khan, an "Enlightened Dictator"?</i>	300
<i>Zia: A Modern Tyrant</i>	323
<i>Musharraf, a New Ayub Khan?</i>	338
7. The Judiciary, the Media and NGOs: In Search of Opposition Forces	373
<i>The Judges: From Submission to Control?</i>	373
<i>The Press: A Fifth Estate?</i>	411
<i>The Opposite of Tocqueville: Democratisation without Civil Society?</i>	427
<i>The Election Commission—a Work in Progress</i>	429

PART THREE

ISLAM: TERRITORIAL IDEOLOGY OR POLITICAL RELIGION?

8. From Jinnah's Secularism to Zia's Islamisation Policy	439
--	-----

CONTENTS

<i>What Islam, for What Policy? (1947–1969)</i>	440
<i>Islamisation and the Politics of Legitimation (1969–1988)</i>	460
9. <i>Jihadism, Sectarianism and Talibanism: From Military/Mullah Cooperation to 9/11</i>	481
<i>The Rise of Sectarianism or the Invention of a New Enemy Within</i>	482
<i>From One Jihad to Another: From Afghanistan to Kashmir and Back</i>	498
<i>The Taliban: The Price of "Friendship"</i>	520
<i>The 11 September 2001 Attacks: A Watershed Moment</i>	523
<i>Musharraf and the Islamists: A Selective Break</i>	528
10. <i>Toward Civil War? The State vs. (some) Islamists and the Islamists vs. the Minorities</i>	543
<i>The Islamists, a Social and Political Force</i>	544
<i>The State's Double Game in Pashtun Areas—and the Islamists' Measured Response</i>	562
<i>The Rise of Extremes</i>	568
<i>The Army: Accomplice and/or Out of Its Depth?</i>	587
<i>Punjab, New Land of Conquest?</i>	609
<i>Minorities under Attack</i>	616
Conclusion	63
<i>One Syndrome, Three Contradictions</i>	632
<i>The Fourth Dimension: Elites Backed by External Support</i>	638
<i>After 16 December 2014: What "Post-Peshawar" Pakistan?</i>	643
Afterword	649
Glossary	655
List of acronyms	659
Bibliography	663
Index	667