

THIRD
EDITION

ISSUES IN PAKISTAN'S ECONOMY

A POLITICAL ECONOMY PERSPECTIVE

S. AKBAR ZAIDI

OXFORD

ISSUES IN PAKISTAN'S ECONOMY

A POLITICAL ECONOMY PERSPECTIVE

THIRD EDITION

15204

S. AKBAR ZAIDI

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of
Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

Published in Pakistan by
Oxford University Press

No. 38, Sector 15, Korangi Industrial Area,
PO Box 8214, Karachi-74900, Pakistan

© Oxford University Press 1999

The moral rights of the author have been asserted

First Edition published in 1999

Second Edition published in 2005

Third Edition published in 2015

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in
a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the
prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted
by law, by licence, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics
rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the
above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the
address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

ISBN 978-0-19-940183-3

Sixth Impression 2022

Typeset in Latin Roman

Printed on 63gsm Offset Paper

Printed by The Times Press (Pvt.) Ltd., Karachi

Contents

Preface to the third edition

Preface to the second edition

Preface to the first edition

List of figures, graphs, and maps

List of tables

Introduction

Chapter 1	Understanding Pakistan's Structural Transformation: 1947–2014	1
1.1	Structural Transformation	3
1.2	Decades and Epochs	4
1.2.1	Laying the Foundations: 1947–58	6
1.2.2	The Decade of Development: 1958–68	6
1.2.3	The Bad Luck Years: 1971–77	7
1.2.4	The Second Military Government: 1977–88	7
1.2.5	Neo-liberalism, Structural Adjustment, and Praetorian Politics	8
1.2.6	Lifestyle Liberalism, Dictatorship, War, and Subjugation: 1999–2007	8
1.2.7	Another Democratic Transition? 2007 Onwards	9
1.3	Transformation and Development: The Balance Sheet	9
1.4	Conclusions	11

Part 1: Agriculture

Chapter 2	Is Pakistan Feudal? A Historical Account of the Development of Agriculture in Pakistan	14
2.1	The Development of Agriculture before the Consolidation of British Rule	14
2.2	The Impact of British Colonialism	17
2.3	Feudal or Capitalist?	19
2.4	Popular Perceptions of Feudalism	21
2.5	Summary and Further Reading	24
2.5.1	Summary	24
2.5.2	Further Reading	24

Chapter 3	The Green Revolution and Land Reforms	31
3.1	The Green Revolution	31
3.1.1	The Issue of the Tube wells	33
3.1.2	Tractorization	33
3.1.3	Regional and Income Disparities	33

3.1.4	Élite Farmer Strategy and Capitalist Development	34
3.1.5	Social and Political Effects	34
3.2	Land Reforms	35
3.2.1	The 1959 Land Reforms	37
3.2.2	The Bhutto Reforms of 1972	38
3.3	Summary and Further Reading	39
3.3.1	Summary	39
3.3.2	Further Reading	39

Chapter 4 The Nature and Direction of Agrarian Change

4.1	Explaining the Numbers	42
4.1.1	Data from the Censuses	43
4.1.2	Changes Over Time	45
4.2	What Do the Numbers Mean?	46
4.3	Summary and Further Reading	57
4.3.1	Summary	57
4.3.2	Further Reading	57

Chapter 5 Agriculture: Critical Issues

5.1	An Overview and Major Trends	62
5.2	Agricultural Pricing Policy	68
5.3	Rural Financial Markets and Agricultural Credit	72
5.3.1	Informal Sources of Credit	78
5.3.2	Formal Sources of Credit	80
5.4	Mechanization	83
5.5	Agricultural Income Tax	86
5.6	The Water Crisis	88
5.7	Land Ownership, Power, and Land Reforms	89
5.8	Summary and Further Reading	94
5.8.1	Summary	94
5.8.2	Further Reading	95

Part 2: Industry and Trade

Chapter 6	The Process of Industrialization in Pakistan I: 1947–77	110
6.1	1947–58: Exchange Rates, Trade Policies, and Import Substituting Industrialization	111
6.1.1	The Impact of the Exchange Rate	112
6.1.2	The Trade Policy Regime	113
6.1.3	The Consequences of Exchange Rate and Trade Policy for Industrialization	114
6.1.4	The End Result	115
6.2	1958–68: The Decade of Development	117

6.2.1	Trade Policy Directing Industrialization	118	9.2.5	Trade Liberalization Under Structural Adjustment: 1988 Onwards	2
6.2.2	Foreign Aid, the Private Sector, and Inequalities	120	9.3	The Debate Over Efficiency and the Trade Regime	21
6.3	1972-77: The Bhutto Years—Bad Luck or Bad Management?	124	9.4	The Exchange Rate	21
6.3.1	Economic Policies and Performance	125	9.5	Dealing with Globalization and World Trade Organization (WTO)	21
6.3.2	The Bad Luck Factor	126	9.5.1	Some Political Economy Issues	21
6.4	Summary and Further Reading	128	9.5.2	Globalization and WTO's Impact on Pakistan	21
6.4.1	Summary	128	9.6	Summary and Further Reading	22
6.4.2	Further Reading	129	9.6.1	Summary	22
			9.6.2	Further Reading	22
Chapter 7	The Process of Industrialization in Pakistan II: 1977-2013	131			
7.1	The Zia Years: 1977-88	132	Part 3: Fiscal Policy		
7.1.1	The Nature and Extent of Growth	132	Chapter 10 Resource Mobilization and the Structure of Taxation	24	
7.1.2	Industrial Policy	134	10.1	The Structure of Government and Taxation	24
7.1.3	The Public/Private Sector Divide	136	10.1.1	Legislative Functions	24
7.1.4	Deregulation and Liberalization	137	10.1.2	Inter-Governmental Fiscal Relations Prior to 2010	25
7.1.5	Causes of High Growth and the Success of the Zia Regime	138	10.2	The Structure of Taxation	25
7.2	The Age of Structural Adjustment: 1988 Onwards	140	10.2.1	Understanding Pakistan's Taxation Structure	25
7.2.1	The Principles of the Programme	140	10.3	Public Finance: The Basic Facts	26
7.2.2	Assessing the Impact on the Industrial Sector	142	10.4	Key Issues in Taxation	26
7.3	Summary and Further Reading	146	10.4.1	Federal Taxes	26
7.3.1	Summary	146	10.4.2	Resource Mobilization at the Provincial Level	27
7.3.2	Further Reading	146	10.4.3	Local Government Revenues	28
Chapter 8	Key Issues in Industry in Pakistan	150	10.5	Summary and Further Reading	28
8.1	Numbers and Trends in Industry	150	10.5.1	Summary	28
8.2	The Small-Scale Manufacturing Sector	153	10.5.2	Further Reading	28
8.2.1	Numbers and Characteristics	153	Chapter 11 Debt and Deficits	290	
8.2.2	Emergence and Growth	155	11.1	Does the Fiscal Deficit Matter?	290
8.2.3	Issues Affecting the Small-Scale Sector	160	11.1.1	Should Budgets Always be Balanced?	300
8.3	The Textile Industry and its Crisis	163	11.1.2	The Problem of Measuring Deficit	300
8.4	Has Public Sector Industry Been a Failure?	168	11.1.3	Fiscal Deficits, Intertemporal Equity, and Distribution	301
8.5	The Privatization Process	171	11.1.4	Macroeconomic Implications	302
8.6	The Debate over Efficiency in the Industrial Structure	176	11.2	Critical Concerns Regarding Pakistan's Fiscal Deficit	302
8.7	The Energy Crisis	182	11.2.1	The IMF/World Bank View of Pakistan's Fiscal Deficit, 1980-97	309
8.7	Summary and Further Reading	190	11.2.2	Re-examining Critical Concerns	310
8.7.1	Summary	190	11.3	The Domestic and Foreign Debt Crises	310
8.7.2	Further Reading	190	11.4	Summary and Further Reading	319
Chapter 9	Balance of Payments and Trade Regimes	199	11.4.1	Summary	319
9.1	Pakistan's Foreign Trade: Basic Facts	199	11.4.2	Further Reading	319
9.2	Trade Policy and Trade Regimes	205			
9.2.1	The Early Years: 1947-58	205			
9.2.2	Trade Policy and the Decade of Development	210			
9.2.3	A New Country: 1972-77	212			
9.2.4	The Beginning of a Liberal Trade Regime: 1977-88	213			

Part 4: Devolution and Fiscal Federalism	329		
Chapter 12 Local Government and the Political Economy of Decentralization	330		
12.1 Local Government in Pakistan	331	13.3	The National Finance Commission Award 2010
12.1.1 The Basic Democracies of the 1960s	331		13.3.1 Population Criteria
12.1.2 Local Government in the 1980s (and 1990s): Urban Pakistan and the Middle Classes	334		13.3.2 Poverty or Backwardness Criteria
12.1.3 Devolution in the New Millennium	338		13.3.3 Revenue Collection and Generation Criteria
12.2 Financing Local Government	340		13.3.4 Tax Collection and Distribution across Federating Units of Pakistan
12.2.1 Financing Under the 1979 Local Government System	342		13.3.5 Inverse Population Density Criteria
12.2.2 Financing Under the 2001 Local Government System	343	13.4	Some Issues Relating to Intergovernmental Fiscal Transfers and the NFC 2010 Award
12.3 Three Military Rulers and Three Local Government Systems	348		13.4.1 Vertical Fiscal Imbalances
12.4 Is Local Government the Answer?	350		13.4.2 Multiple criteria and the Way forward
12.4.1 The Contribution of Municipal Government in Development	350		13.4.3 Sales Tax and Provinces
12.4.2 Potential for Development by Local Governments	350		13.4.4 Substitution of Fiscal Effort by Sub-National Governments
12.4.3 Is Local Government the Answer?	351		13.4.5 Conditional versus Unconditional Grants
12.5 Summary and Further Reading	351	13.5	13.4.6 Fiscal Federalism and Poverty Reduction
12.5.1 Summary	351		The Case of Fiscal Equalization
12.5.2 Further Reading	353		13.5.1 Fiscal Equalization Index (FEI)
			13.5.2 Fiscal Equalization with Dominance of Indirect Taxes and Distribution of Resources in Real Terms
Chapter 13 Fiscal Federalism in Pakistan: Emerging Dynamics, Issues, and Prospects	362	13.6	The 18th Amendment: The Way Forward to Devolution?
13.1 Pre-Independence Evolution and Development	362	13.7	Summary and Further Reading
13.1.1 The Otto Niemeyer Award 1936	363		13.7.1 Summary
13.1.2 Post-Independence Evolution and Developments—NFC Awards in Retrospect	363		13.7.2 Further Readings
13.2 The National Finance Commission Award: An Introduction	363		
13.2.1 The Raisman Award 1951	365	Part 5: Monetary Policy and Financial and Capital Markets	391
13.2.2 The National Finance Commission 1961–62	365	Chapter 14 Financial and Capital Markets	392
13.2.3 The National Finance Commission Award 1964	367	14.1 The Development of the Banking Sector	393
13.2.4 The National Finance Committee 1970	369	14.1.1 The First Phase: 1947–74	393
13.2.5 The National Finance Commission Award 1974	370	14.1.2 The Relationship between Economic Growth and the Development of Banking	394
13.2.6 The National Finance Commission Awards, 1979 and 1985	370	14.1.3 Nationalization in the 1970s	396
13.2.7 The National Finance Commission Award 1990	371	14.1.4 Islamic Banking	397
13.2.8 The National Finance Commission Award 1997	371	14.1.5 Developments since 1988	398
13.2.9 The National Finance Commission Award 2006	372	14.1.6 Banking Trends: 1964–2012	399
		14.1.7 Development Finance Institutions (DFIs) and Non-Bank Financial Institutions (NBFIs)	401
		14.1.8 Some Salient Issues in the Banking Sector	402
		14.1.9 Excluding the Majority: Limited Access to Finance in Pakistan	405
		14.2 The Equities Market	407
		14.3 Summary and Further Reading	410

14.3.1	Summary	410	17.6	The Political Economy of Structural Adjustment Programmes in Pakistan
14.3.2	Further Reading	411	17.6.1	Pakistan's Dependence on Washington, or are Governments Autonomous?
Chapter 15 Monetary Policy, Savings, and Inflation 423			17.6.2	Did Pakistan Need to Go to the IMF in the 1990s?
15.1	Monetary Policy and Monetary Management in Pakistan	423	17.6.3	Why Does Pakistan Accept IMF Programmes?
15.2	Money Supply and Monetary Expansion	432		Summary and Further Reading
15.3	Inflation and its Causes	432	17.7.1	Summary
15.4	The Low Savings Rate	439	17.7.2	Further Reading
15.5	Summary and Further Reading	444		
15.5.1	Summary	444		
15.5.2	Further Reading	444		
Part 6: Neo-liberalism, Stabilization, and Macroeconomics: From ESAFs to PRSPs to SBAs—1988 to the present 457			Chapter 18 Macroeconomic Developments: 1998–2013	
Chapter 16 Structural Adjustment Programmes: Composition and Effects 458			18.1	Before and After May 1998
16.1	The Development and Export of Development Thinking	459	18.2	11 September 2001: The Day the World Changed
16.2	From Structural Adjustment Loans to Structural Adjustment Programmes	460	18.3	What Happened to the Debt Crisis?
16.3	Structural Adjustment Programmes: Composition	465	18.4	The Growing Forex Reserves
16.4	Structural Adjustment Programmes: Implementation and Effects	467	18.5	Did the Economy Turnaround?
16.5	Economic Liberalization and Openness: Some Questionable Assertions	469	18.6	Musharraf and After: 2004–2008
16.5.1	The Contextuality of Policy	471	18.7	The Pakistan People's Party's Economic Policies 2008–2013: Bad Luck or Bad Management?
16.5.2	International Capital and the Loss of National Autonomy	473	18.8	Summary and Further Reading
16.6	Summary and Further Reading	473	18.8.1	Summary
16.6.1	Summary	473	18.8.2	Further Reading
16.6.2	Further Reading	475		
Chapter 17 The IMF and Structural Adjustment Programmes in Pakistan 483			Part 7: The Social Sectors: Institutions and Governance 558	
17.1	History	483	Chapter 19 The Social Sectors I: International Comparisons, Education, Population, Urbanization, and Housing 558	
17.2	Implementation of the Structural Adjustment Programmes in Pakistan: An Examination of the 1988 Programme	488	19.1	Some International and Regional Comparisons
17.2.1	Fiscal Policy	488	19.2	The Impact of Economic Growth 2002–07
17.2.2	Trade	489	19.2.1	Finally on Track?
17.2.3	Financial Sector	489	19.3	Education
17.3	Was the 1988 Structural Adjustment Programme a Success? Achievements and Failures	489	19.3.1	Statistics
17.3.1	Fiscal Policy	490	19.3.2	The Issues
17.3.2	Trade and Balance of Payments	490	19.3.3	Summarizing the Issues in Education
17.3.3	Financial Sector	491	19.4	Population Welfare and Family Planning: The Demographic Transition
17.3.4	Liberalization and Privatization	491	19.4.1	The Evolution of the Population Welfare Programme
17.3.5	Other Areas	491	19.4.2	Knowledge and Usage
17.4	The World Bank/IMF's Overall Evaluation of the 1988 Structural Adjustment Programme	492	19.4.3	Some Issues
17.5	The 2008 Stand-By Agreement	494	19.4.4	Pakistan's Demography: Dividend or Disaster?
			19.5	Urbanization and Housing
			19.5.1	The Extent of Urbanization
			19.5.2	Rethinking Urban and Rural
			19.5.3	Housing in Cities
			19.5.4	The Demand for Low Income Housing in Pakistan

19.7	Summary and Further Reading	582	21.10	Summary and Further Reading	646
19.7.1	Summary	582	21.10.1	Summary	646
19.7.2	Further Reading	582	21.10.2	Further Reading	646
Chapter 20	The Social Sectors II: MDGs, Gender, Environment, NGOs, Institutions, and Governance	589	Part 8: Poverty and Inequality		649
20.1	Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)	589	Chapter 22	Poverty: Trends, Causes, and Solutions	650
20.2	Gender Inequality and Women	591	22.1	What Does Poverty Mean?	650
20.2.1	Statistics	591	22.2	Trends in Poverty	652
20.2.2	Some Issues	595	22.3	Who Are the Poor and Where Do They Live?	656
20.2.3	Finding Some Options	596	22.4	Explaining the Trends in Poverty 1960–88	658
20.3	The Environment	597	22.5	Poverty in Pakistan: 1988–2013	662
20.4	Institutional Issues in the Social Sector	604	22.6	Poverty Alleviation	665
20.5	Governance, Decentralization, and Local Level Delivery	606	22.7	Poverty and Bonded Labour	669
20.5.1	Government and Development in Pakistan	607	22.8	Can Poverty be Eliminated in Pakistan?	672
20.6	NGOs and Community Participation	609	22.9	Summary and Further Reading	674
20.7	Summary and Further Reading	613	22.9.1	Summary	674
20.7.1	Summary	613	22.9.2	Further Reading	674
20.7.2	Further Reading	613	Chapter 23	Regional and Income Inequalities	687
Chapter 21	The Social Sectors III: The Health Sector and the Health-Poverty Nexus	624	23.1	Regional Inequalities: Districts and Provinces	687
21.1	Health and Poverty	624	23.1.1	Methodology and Results	688
21.2	Examining Health Data: Health Status, Health Spending, and the Poor	625	23.1.2	The Issues	693
21.2.1	Health Status	625	23.2	Regional Inequalities: Agro-Climatic Zones	699
21.2.2	Examining Health Data	626	23.3	The Case of Karachi: Economic, Social, and Demographic Aspects	701
21.2.3	Utilization of Health Facilities	629	23.3.1	Economic and Social Aspects	703
21.2.4	Health Spending and Health Expenditure	630	23.3.2	Revenue Collection	705
21.3	Health Outcomes and Non-Medical Interventions	631	23.3.3	An Economic Appraisal of Karachi	705
21.4	The Poor and the Socio-economic Impact of Communicable Diseases	632	23.3.4	Implications for NFC Transfers	706
21.5	The Issues of Price, Cost, and Access to Treatment	633	23.3.5	Demographic Trends	707
21.5.1	How Much Does it Cost to Cure Tuberculosis?	634	23.3.6	Karachi as a Province?	707
21.6	The Impact of Public and Private Provision of Health Care on the Poor	636	23.4	Income Inequalities	710
21.7	The Role of Government in the Control of Communicable Diseases	637	23.5	Conclusions	714
21.7.1	The National Health Policy 2001	638	23.6	Summary and Further Reading	714
21.7.2	The Extended Programme of Immunization	639	23.6.1	Summary	714
21.7.3	The National Tuberculosis Control Programme	640	23.6.2	Further Reading	715
21.7.4	The Lady Health Workers Programme	640	Part 9: Political Economics		721
21.8	Intervening in the Health-Poverty Nexus: The World Health Organization Commission on Macroeconomics and Health	641	Chapter 24	The Political Economy of Neighbourly Relations	722
21.9	Rethinking Intervention in the Health-Poverty Nexus: Health, or Poverty?	644	24.1	India and Pakistan: A Brief Comparison	724
			24.2	Theorizing Trade, War, and Peace	725
			24.3	Trade with India	728
			24.4	The Benefits and Constraints of Trading with India	734
			24.4.1	The Simple Benefits of Trade	734
			24.4.2	Complicating Simplicity: The Interests of the Military	736
			24.5	Constraints and Possibilities: A Matter of Survival	736
			24.6	The Importance of Trade with India	736
			24.6	Summary and Further Reading	750

24.6.1	Summary	750	26.5
24.6.2	Further Reading	750	26.6
			26.7

Chapter 25 War, Destruction, and Aid

25.1	The Costs of the War on Terror	753
25.2	War and Aid: Who Benefits from US Aid to Pakistan?	754
25.2.1	Fifty Years of Aid to Pakistan 1950–2002	754
25.3	The Complicated Issues of US Aid after 9/11	758
25.3.1	The Purpose of Aid	758
25.3.2	Has the Purpose of Aid Been Achieved?	758
25.3.3	Economic and Humanitarian Aid and Assistance	760
25.4	The Consequences of Aid	761
25.5	The Nature of Recent US Aid to Pakistan	763
25.6	Who Benefits from US Aid to Pakistan?	768
25.7	Summary and Further Reading	769
25.7.1	Summary	769
25.7.2	Further Reading	769

Chapter 26 Political Economics: Class, State, Power, and Transition

26.1	Civilian Bureaucracy and Industrialization: 1947–58	783
26.2	Civil and Military Bureaucratic Capitalism: 1958–71	784
26.3	A Shift in Emphasis: 1971–77	785
26.4	A Military State and the Middle Classes: 1977–88	785

	Elections Without Democracy: 1988–99
	The Return of the Military: 1999 Onwards
	Issues in Pakistan's Political Economy
26.7.1	Pakistan's Middle Classes
26.7.2	The Pakistani Military's Economic Interests and Their Consequences
26.7.3	Pakistan's Praetorian Democracy and Technocrats as Apologists
26.7.4	Pakistan's State and Society: Groups, Fractions, and Influence
26.7.5	Urbanism as a Way of Life
26.7.6	Is Pakistan a Failed State?
	Summary and Further Reading
26.8.1	Summary
26.8.2	Further Reading

Chapter 27 A New Political Economy?

27.1	Transitions
27.1.1	The View in Mid-2011: Was Pakistan Near Collapse?
27.1.2	The Old and the New in <i>Naya</i> Pakistan: Elections 2013
27.2	The Changing Character of the Pakistani State
27.2.1	Theorizing the Pakistani State
27.3	A State Without Power? The Fracturization of Power in Pakistan
27.4	Conclusions

Selected Bibliography

Index